

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

SHENECQUA BUTT, et al :

CIVIL ACTION

v.

NO. 09-4285

UNITED BROTHERHOOD OF  
CARPENTERS & JOINERS OF  
AMERICA, et al

---

THERESA HOWARD

CIVIL ACTION

v.

NO. 13-374 (consolidated with 09-4285)

METROPOLITAN REGIONAL  
COUNSEL OF CARPENERTS &  
JOINERS OF AMERICA, et al

---

**ORDER**

**AND NOW** this 16<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2016, upon review of Defendants' Motions in Limine pertaining to the Center for Forensic Economic Studies "CFES" (Doc. 143) and all related responses and submissions, and for the reasons stated in the foregoing Memorandum, it is hereby **ORDERED** that said Motion is **GRANTED**. Plaintiffs are precluded from offering the opinion evidence of CFES or the statistical data upon which it relies.

**BY THE COURT:**

/s/ David R. Strawbridge

**David R. Strawbridge**  
**United States Magistrate Judge**